



BACKGROUND NOTE

**Overview of OSCE Commitments
and Recommendations from Key OSCE Events in 2005/2006
in the Area of Tolerance and Non-Discrimination**

**Prepared for the OSCE High Level Conference
on Combating Discrimination and Promoting Mutual
Respect and Understanding**

Bucharest, 7-8 June 2007

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART I:	General Overview of OSCE Actions in the Field of Tolerance and Non-Discrimination	3
PART II:	Overview of General Trends and Challenges in the Response of OSCE participating States to Hate-Motivated Crimes and Incidents	6
PART III:	Compilation of Key Commitments requiring Specific Actions and Measures by OSCE participating States	9
PART IV:	Summary of 2003-2006 Ministerial Council Taskings Given to the ODIHR in the Area of Tolerance and Non-Discrimination	15
PART V:	Compilation of Recommendations from key OSCE Events in 2005/200	20
ANNEX 1:	The ODIHR's Toolbox to Combat Hate	37
ANNEX 2:	Information Submitted to the ODIHR between 2004-2007: Legislation, Statistics, Practical Initiatives and Points of Contact on Combating Hate Crime	40

General Overview of OSCE Actions in the Field of Tolerance and Non-Discrimination

In recognition of the fact that violent manifestations of hatred and intolerance threaten not only the security of individuals, but also stability and security in the OSCE region, the OSCE has in recent years, intensified its efforts to develop an Organization-wide response for countering these phenomena.

OSCE commitments related to non-discrimination and the promotion of freedom of religion or belief date back to the 1975 Helsinki Final Act. However, in response to an increase in racist, xenophobic, anti-Semitic incidents and other acts of intolerance, including against Muslims, Christians, and members of other religions in the OSCE region, the first *stand-alone decision specifically on tolerance and non-discrimination* was adopted during the 2002 Porto Ministerial Council Meeting. The decision called for separately designated human dimension events on the topics of anti-Semitism, discrimination and racism and xenophobia which resulted in the convening of two tolerance-related events in 2003. The decision also tasked the Chairman-in-Office and the Permanent Council in close co-operation with the ODIHR, the High Commissioner on National Minorities (HCNM) and the Representative on Freedom of the Media (RFoM) to ensure an effective follow-up of the present decision, through increased use of tools already available to the OSCE, including the annual human dimension meetings and seminars.

The 2003 Maastricht Ministerial Council Decision re-affirmed the OSCE's commitment to promote tolerance and discrimination in all fields and tasked the Permanent Council to further discuss ways and means of increasing the efforts of the OSCE and participating States in this regard. The decision encouraged all participating States to combat hate crime through strengthened legislation and data collection.

The ODIHR was mandated to play an increased role in tolerance and non-discrimination issues and was given a significant number of taskings, including serving as a collection and dissemination point for statistics, legislation and good practices in the area of tolerance and non-discrimination and reporting regularly on these issues as a basis for deciding on priorities for future work. The importance of freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief was also re-affirmed and participating States were encouraged to seek the assistance of the ODIHR and its Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief.

The Council also adopted the OSCE Action Plan on the Situation of Roma and Sinti within the OSCE Area, adding a number of concrete taskings to participating States, the ODIHR and other actors. The need to promote implementation of the 2004 OSCE Action Plan for the Promotion of Gender Equality was also emphasized, along with the need to advance the implementation of OSCE commitments on national minorities. The decision tasked the Permanent Council, the ODIHR, the HCNM and the RFoM, in close collaboration with the Chairmanship-in-Office, to ensure an effective follow-up to the relevant provisions of the decision.

In 2004, three further OSCE events were held to address anti-Semitism, racism, xenophobia and discrimination as well as the relationship between propaganda on the internet and hate crimes. These events resulted in further commitments adopted by the 2004 Sofia Ministerial Council, including in the areas of education, media, legislation, law enforcement, migration and religious freedom. The decisions gave further taskings to the ODIHR, namely to provide support to civil society and to closely follow incidents motivated by racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism, discrimination against Muslims and other forms of intolerance, and to report its findings to the Permanent Council and at the HDIM. The decision also stated that the ODIHR's reports should be taken into account in deciding on priorities for the work of the OSCE in the area of intolerance. In order to give increased prominence to the issue of tolerance and non-discrimination, the Bulgarian Chairman-in-Office appointed three Personal Representatives who were re-appointed by the Slovenian, Belgian and Spanish Chairmanships.

In 2005, a high-level conference on "Anti-Semitism and on Other Forms of Intolerance" was held and followed up with the 2005 Ljubljana Ministerial Council Decision which highlighted the need to intensify educational programmes to promote mutual respect and understanding and tasked the ODIHR to provide assistance in this regard. The contribution of the OSCE to the UN Alliance of Civilizations Initiative was also mentioned as a priority area and the Secretary General was given the role of coordinating the OSCE's input in this regard.

With the adoption of the Unified Budget in 2005, a new Programme on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination was officially established within the ODIHR. In order to ensure that the OSCE's increased activities complemented and reinforced the work of other inter-governmental organisations active in the fight against intolerance and discrimination, the ODIHR commissioned a study on the activities of the Council of Europe, the European Union and the United Nations in this area. It was concluded that one of the ODIHR's main comparative advantages is its ability to provide technical assistance and support to OSCE states in implementing not only OSCE commitments but also other international standards and recommendations of other international organizations. Subsequently, the ODIHR has developed tools to support States through expert-to-expert technical assistance programmes in the cross-cutting areas of education, legislative assistance, law enforcement training, data collection and civil society capacity building.

In 2006, three separate Tolerance Implementation Meetings were held in order to intensify implementation of commitments. The meetings addressed the promotion of Inter-Cultural, Inter-Religious and Inter-Ethnic Understanding (Almaty); Education to promote Mutual Respect and Understanding and to Teach about the Holocaust (Dubrovnik); and Hate Crime Data Collection (Vienna).

The 2006 Brussels Ministerial Council Decision tasked the Permanent Council to consider ways to further strengthen the effectiveness, coherence and consistency of the work of the OSCE in combating intolerance and discrimination and promoting mutual respect and understanding, with a view towards more effective implementation of commitments. OSCE structures were also encouraged, within their existing mandates, to incorporate elements combating intolerance and discrimination and the promotion of mutual respect and understanding into their current and future

activities. The ODIHR was tasked to strengthen the work of its Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Programme, in particular its assistance programmes, in order to support participating States in implementing their commitments. The ODIHR was also tasked to strengthen its early warning function to identify, report and raise awareness on hate-motivated incidents and trends and to provide recommendations and assistance to participating States in areas where more adequate responses are needed. The RFoM was encouraged to review best practices in matters of his competence related to intolerance and the OSCE's further contribution to the report of the High Level Group of the UN Alliance of Civilization Initiative was also highlighted as area of continued importance for the OSCE.

Under the 2007 Spanish Chairmanship, tolerance and non-discrimination issues have again been declared an important priority area for the OSCE. A high-level OSCE conference on tolerance and non-discrimination issues will be held as well as a Chairmanship event on intolerance and discrimination against Muslims. The Personal Representatives of the Chairman-in-Office were also re-appointed under the Spanish Chairmanship, subject to a decision taken at the Ministerial Council in Brussels to review their contribution to this overall effort by the Chairman-in-Office, in consultation with the participating States, in the course of 2007.

Overview of General Trends and Challenges in the Response of OSCE participating States to Hate-Motivated Crimes and Incidents

Note: This overview is an abstract of information contained in the ODIHR October 2006 report on Challenges and Responses to Hate-Motivated Incidents in the OSCE Region (for the period January-June 2006) and its November 2006 Common Responsibility Report, both based on close consultations between the participating States and the ODIHR. Both reports are available at www.osce.org/odihr

Despite the numerous commitments taken by OSCE participating States to combating intolerance and discrimination, much work remains to be done to foster pluralistic and inclusive societies where ethnic, cultural, and religious diversity is valued and appreciated.

Significant progress has been made by several States through efforts to strengthen legislation, increase co-operation with civil society actors, and intensify educational programmes to promote mutual respect and understanding. The concern expressed in the Lisbon agenda with regard to aggressive nationalism and other forms of intolerance and their threat to stability remains valid. Violent manifestations of hatred and violations of religious freedom have increased in a number of countries in recent years; this, in turn, raises the need for intensified efforts to fight intolerance and discrimination.

The ODIHR has recently reported on several trends related to the nature and scope of acts of hatred and intolerance.

Community-Specific Concerns:

- Numerous anti-Semitic incidents were documented, involving violence targeting Jewish sites, symbols, and persons, as well as acts of verbal abuse prompted by increasing resentment and hostility towards Jews, often in connection with developments in international politics. In many cases, different types of resentment overlap, as does the perception of certain groups as both religious and national.
- Incidents against Muslims are fuelled by a combination of racism, hostility towards Islam and its adherents, powerful anti-immigrant sentiment, and the association of Muslims and Islam with terrorism. The sense of fear and vulnerability created by terrorist attacks and by concerns over immigration and integration issues has been exploited by far-right groups, and has led some media and political parties to publicly portray Muslims and immigrants as a threat to European security and economic well-being. People are wrongly led to believe that the traditions and values of Muslims are incompatible with those of contemporary pluralistic societies. The onus of addressing and

redressing this misperception generally falls upon the authorities within participating States.

- Christians and members of other religions face restrictions on their religious freedom. Problems include discrimination against individuals in the workplace and public services; the disruption or prohibition of worship even in private homes; defamation campaigns against minority religious groups including verbal harassment and threats against Christian proselytes; abuse of missionary activity; lack of transparency and consistency in registration procedures; unlawful confiscation of property of religious communities and individuals; violent attacks against religious buildings and vandalism of cemeteries; censorship of religious literature, and imprisonment of those who object to military service on religious grounds. These restrictions may be a direct result of state legislation and policies, or, in other cases, they may arise as a result of a lack of protective action from state authorities, often in the face of a dominant religious majority.
- Recent years have seen the resurgence of centuries-old prejudices and hostilities against Roma and Sinti, who are negatively portrayed, especially in the debates around European enlargement and on the reform of asylum and immigration laws and of social-welfare systems. Despite slow progress in a number of participating States, obstacles and challenges persist. While relations between Romani communities and the police have traditionally been strained, there are an increasing number of reports suggesting that the police use disproportionate force and resort to violence that could be qualified as degrading treatment. States are encouraged to request the assistance of the relevant OSCE institutions and joint expert teams to document existing institutional practices and to provide advice on policing in multiethnic societies. For many Roma and Sinti, obtaining legal residence with secure living conditions is a prerequisite for the fulfilment of other rights. Without an address, it is often impossible to register for public services or engage in lawful income-generating activities. Problems include: forced evictions, lack of secure land tenure, inadequate alternative housing, lack of civil registration and of voting registration, and the inability of Roma and Sinti children to attend school.
- In the course of collecting information on hate crimes in the OSCE region in line with its mandate, the ODIHR has noted a large number of such violent incidents directed at persons because of their perceived sexual orientation. Many participating States include sexual orientation among the prohibited grounds for discrimination in their national legislation. However, because of the specific situation surrounding sexual and gender identity, violent crimes and attacks against individuals are frequently unreported, undocumented and therefore often ultimately unpunished. In the face of this reality, the responsibility of participating States to extend effective protection is further heightened.

Cross-Cutting Areas of Concern:

- Most States lack accurate data about the nature and extent of hate crime, which means that law enforcement and criminal-justice agencies are not armed with the information needed to combat such crimes. This is often compounded by the lack of an adequate legislative basis for defining and criminalizing hate crimes and other forms of intolerance, making it difficult to prosecute such cases.
- The strong influence that the media and political leaders can have in either countering or exacerbating misperceptions, prejudices, and biases has been evident in recent years, as has the internationalization of what might initially have seemed to be isolated incidents.
- The rise of racist, xenophobic, anti-Semitic and discriminatory discourse by political leaders and the growing tendency for such discourse to be used by mainstream political parties also gives cause for concern.
- Throughout the OSCE region, the Internet is increasingly used as an instrument for spreading hate and inciting violent attacks against individuals. The rise of anti-Muslim, anti-Christian, anti-Semitic, xenophobic, racist, homophobic and other discriminatory discourse by political leaders and the growing tendency for such discourse to be used by mainstream political parties has also contributed to a climate of intolerance in some participating States.

Compilation of Key Commitments requiring Specific Actions and Measures by OSCE participating States

Under the 2003 Maastricht Ministerial Council Decision, the Ministerial Council:

- Committed itself to promote the implementation of the **Action Plan on Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti within the OSCE Area**.
- Decided to enhance the efforts being made to increase **women's participation** and the role of women in furthering democratization and economic development, and to consider integrating the provisions of the **OSCE Action Plan on Gender Issues** where applicable into national policies.
- Decided to enhance its efforts to achieve **gender balance** at all levels within the OSCE, taking full account also in this respect of the principle of recruiting staff from all participating States on a fair basis.
- Encouraged all participating States to:
 - **collect and keep records on reliable information and statistics on hate crimes**, including on forms of violent manifestations of racism, xenophobia, discrimination, and anti-Semitism
 - **inform the ODIHR about existing legislation** regarding crimes fuelled by intolerance and discrimination, and, where appropriate, seek the ODIHR's assistance in the drafting and review of such legislation;
 - **seek the assistance of the ODIHR** and its Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief.
- Committed itself to ensure and facilitate the freedom of the individual to **profess and practice a religion or belief**, alone or in community with others, where necessary through transparent and non-discriminatory laws, regulations, practices and policies.
- Committed itself to ensure the advancement of the implementation of the OSCE commitments on **national minorities**, and recognizes the importance of the recommendations of the HCNM on education, public participation, and language, including on its use in broadcast media, and the relevant recommendations of the RFoM in this regard.
- Committed itself to combat **discrimination against migrant workers** and to facilitate the integration of migrant workers into the societies in which they are legally residing.
- Committed itself to combat, subject to national legislation and international commitments, discrimination, where existing, against **asylum seekers and refugees**.
- Decided that the OSCE increase its efforts towards the **younger generation** in order to build up their understanding of the need for tolerance.

Under the 2004 Sofia Ministerial Council Decision, the Ministerial Council:

- Endorsed the Permanent Council Decisions on Combating Anti-Semitism (PC.DEC/607) and on Tolerance and the Fight against Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination (PC.DEC/621) and the Permanent Council Decision on Promoting Tolerance and Media Freedom on the Internet (PC.DEC/633)
- Decided to intensify efforts for the implementation of these three decisions, which include commitments in the fields of, *inter alia*, **education, media, legislation, law enforcement, migration and religious freedom;**
- Endeavoured to provide the ODIHR with the appropriate resources to accomplish the tasks agreed upon in the Maastricht Ministerial Decision on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination;
- Through the endorsement of the Permanent Council Decisions, the Ministerial Council committed the participating States to undertake the following actions in the various thematic areas:

Legislation

- Consider enacting or strengthening, where appropriate, legislation that prohibits discrimination based on, or incitement to hate crimes motivated by, race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status;
- Strive to ensure that their legal systems foster a safe environment free from anti-Semitic harassment, violence or discrimination in all fields of life;
- study the effectiveness of laws and other measures regulating Internet content, specifically with regard to their effect on the rate of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic crimes;
- Examine the possibility of establishing within countries appropriate bodies to promote tolerance and to combat racism, xenophobia, discrimination or related intolerance, including against Muslims, and anti-Semitism;

Education

- Promote, as appropriate, educational programmes for combating anti-Semitism and promoting remembrance of and, as appropriate, education about the tragedy of the Holocaust, and the importance of respect for all ethnic and religious groups;
- Promote and enhance, as appropriate, educational programmes for fostering tolerance and combating racism, xenophobia and discrimination;
- Encourage the establishment of programmes to educate children and youth about expression motivated by racist, xenophobic, anti-Semitic or other related bias they may encounter on the Internet. Also, as appropriate, participating States and Internet service providers should take steps to increase parental awareness of widely available filtering software that enables parents to exercise greater supervision and control over their children's use of the Internet. Materials on successful

educational programmes and filtering software should be widely disseminated as part of the exchange of best practices;

Media

- Combat hate crimes, which can be fuelled by racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda in the media and on the Internet, and appropriately denounce such crimes publicly when they occur;
- Encourage the promotion of tolerance, dialogue, respect and mutual understanding through the Media, including the Internet;
- Take action to ensure that the Internet remains an open and public forum for freedom of opinion and expression, as enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and to foster access to the Internet both in homes and in schools;
- Investigate and, where applicable, fully prosecute violence and criminal threats of violence, motivated by racist, xenophobic, anti-Semitic or other related bias on the Internet;

Law Enforcement

- Collect and maintain reliable information and statistics about crimes motivated by racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and related discrimination and intolerance, committed within their territory, report such information periodically to the ODIHR and make this information available to the public;
- Encourage development of informal exchanges among experts in appropriate fora on best practices and experiences in law enforcement and education;
- Consider establishing training programmes for law enforcement and judicial officials on legislation and enforcement of legislation relating to hate crimes;
- Train law enforcement agents and prosecutors on how to address crimes motivated by racist, xenophobic, anti-Semitic or other related bias on the Internet and should share information on successful training programmes as part of the exchange of best practices;

Migration

- Take steps, in conformity with their domestic law and international obligations, against discrimination, intolerance and xenophobia against migrants and migrant workers;
- Consider undertaking activities to raise public awareness of the enriching contribution of migrants and migrant workers to society;

Religious Freedom

- Promote and facilitate open and transparent interfaith and intercultural dialogue and partnerships towards tolerance, respect and mutual understanding and ensure and facilitate the freedom of the individual to profess and practice a religion or belief, alone or in community with others, including through transparent and non-discriminatory laws, regulations, practices and policies;

Under the 2005 Ljubljana Ministerial Council Decision, the Ministerial Council:

- Decided that the participating States while implementing their commitments to promote tolerance and non-discrimination will focus their activities in such fields as, *inter alia*, **legislation, law enforcement, education, media, data collection, migration and integration, religious freedom, inter-cultural and inter-faith dialogue**, and commit to:
 - Consider increasing their efforts to **ensure that national legislation, policies and practices provide to all persons equal and effective protection of the law and prohibit acts of intolerance and discrimination**, in accordance with relevant OSCE commitments and their relevant international obligations;
 - Strengthen efforts to provide public officials, and in particular **law enforcement officers, with appropriate training on responding to and preventing hate crimes**, and in this regard, to consider setting up programmes that provide such training, and to consider drawing on ODIHR expertise in this field and to share best practices;
 - Encourage **public and private educational programmes that promote tolerance and non-discrimination**, and raise public awareness of the existence and the unacceptability of intolerance and discrimination, and in this regard, to consider **drawing on ODIHR expertise and assistance in order to develop methods and curricula** for tolerance education in general, including:
 - **Fighting racial prejudice and hatred, xenophobia and discrimination;**
 - **Education on and remembrance of the Holocaust**, as well as other genocides, recognized as such in accordance with the 1948 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, and crimes against humanity;
 - **Education on anti-Semitism** in order to ensure a systematic approach to education, including curricula related to contemporary forms of anti-Semitism in participating States;
 - Fighting prejudice, intolerance and discrimination against **Christians, Muslims and members of other religions;**
 - Consider developing, in close co-operation with civil society, concrete measures which do not endanger freedom of information and expression, in order **to counter xenophobic stereotypes, intolerance and discrimination in the media** and to encourage programmes to educate children and youth about prejudice or bias they may encounter in the media or on the Internet;
 - Strengthen efforts to collect and maintain reliable information and **statistics on hate crimes and legislation** within their territories, to report such information periodically to the ODIHR, and to make this information available to the public and to consider drawing on ODIHR

assistance in this field, and in this regard, to consider nominating national points of contact on hate crimes to the ODIHR;

- Continue, with the support of relevant OSCE structures, institutions and field operations if necessary, to **address the issue of migration and integration with respect for cultural and religious diversity** as part of the overall efforts by the OSCE to promote tolerance, mutual respect and understanding and to combat discrimination, as well as to promote respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms.

Under the 2006 Brussels Ministerial Council Decision, the Ministerial Council:

- Tasks the Permanent Council to consider ways to further strengthen the effectiveness, coherence and consistency of the work of the OSCE in combating intolerance and discrimination and promoting mutual respect and understanding, from 2007 onwards, with a view towards **more effective implementation of commitments**;
- Encourages the participating States to recognize the positive contribution that all individuals can make to the harmonious pluralistic character of our societies by **promoting policies focusing on equality of opportunity, rights, access to justice and public services, and on fostering dialogue and effective participation**;
- Commits to **raise awareness of the value of cultural and religious diversity as a source of mutual enrichment of societies** and to recognize the importance of integration with respect for cultural and religious diversity as a key element to promote mutual respect and understanding;
- Calls upon the participating States to address the root causes of intolerance and discrimination by encouraging the **development of comprehensive domestic education policies and strategies** as well as through increased awareness-raising measures that:
 - Promote a greater understanding of and respect for different cultures, ethnicities, religions or beliefs;
 - Aim to prevent intolerance and discrimination, including against Christians, Jews, Muslims and members of other religions;
 - Promote remembrance and education about the tragedy of the Holocaust, as well as other genocides, recognized as such in accordance with the 1948 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, and crimes against humanity
- Encourages the continuation and further development of good practice activities such as **human rights education** at an early age throughout the OSCE region and to organize an OSCE youth event in 2007 taking into account the experience and expertise of other relevant international and regional organizations in this field in order to avoid duplication;

- Decides to **promote capacity-building of law enforcement authorities through training** and the development of guidelines on the most effective and appropriate way to respond to bias-motivated crime, to increase a positive interaction between police and victims and to encourage reporting by victims of hate crime, i.e., training for front-line officers, implementation of outreach programmes to improve relations between police and the public and training in providing referrals for victim assistance and protection;
- Encourages the participating States to **step up their efforts** in implementing their commitments **to collect and maintain reliable data and statistics on hate crimes** which are essential for effective policy formulation and appropriate resource allocation in countering hate-motivated incidents and, in this context, also invites the participating States to **facilitate the capacity development of civil society to contribute in monitoring and reporting hate motivated incidents and to assist victims of hate crimes;**
- Decides that the participating **States should engage more actively in encouraging civil society's activities through effective partnerships and strengthened dialogue and co-operation** between civil society and State authorities in the sphere of promoting mutual respect and understanding, equal opportunities and inclusion of all within society and combating intolerance, including by establishing local, regional or national consultation mechanisms where appropriate.

Summary of 2003-2006 Ministerial Council Taskings Given to the ODIHR in the Area of Tolerance and Non-Discrimination

Ministerial Council Decision No. 4 (Maastricht MC 2003)

- Encourages all participating States to collect and keep records on reliable information and statistics on hate crimes, including on forms of violent manifestations of racism, xenophobia, discrimination, and anti-Semitism, as discussed and recommended in the above-mentioned conferences. Recognizing the importance of legislation to combat hate crimes, **participating States will inform the ODIHR about existing legislation regarding crimes fuelled by intolerance and discrimination, and, where appropriate, seek the ODIHR's assistance in the drafting and review of such legislation;**
- **Tasks the ODIHR, in full co-operation, *inter alia*, with the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (UNCERD), the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) and the European Monitoring Center on Racism and Xenophobia (EUMC), as well as relevant NGOs, with serving as a collection point for information and statistics collected by participating States, and with reporting regularly on these issues, including in the format of the Human Dimension Implementation Meeting, as a basis for deciding on priorities for future work.**
- **The ODIHR will, *inter alia*, promote best practices and disseminate lessons learned in the fight against intolerance and discrimination;**
- Encourages the participating States to **seek the assistance of the ODIHR and its Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief.**
- Undertakes to combat discrimination against migrant workers. Further undertakes to facilitate the integration of migrant workers into the societies in which they are legally residing. **Calls on the ODIHR to reinforce its activities in this respect;**
- Undertakes, in this context, to combat, subject to national legislation and international commitments, discrimination, where existing, against asylum seekers and refugees, and **calls on the ODIHR to reinforce its activities in this respect;**
- Tasks the Permanent Council, **the ODIHR, the HCNM and the RFoM, in close co-operation with the Chairmanship-in-Office, with ensuring an effective follow-up to the relevant provisions of the present decision, and requests the Permanent Council to address the operational and funding modalities for the implementation of this decision.**

Ministerial Council Decision No. 12 (Sofia MC 2004)

PC Decision 601 on Combating Anti-Semitism

Tasks participating States to:

- Collect and maintain reliable information and statistics about anti-Semitic crimes, and other hate crimes, committed within their territory, **report such information periodically to the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR)**, and make this information available to the public;
- **Endeavour to provide the ODIHR with the appropriate resources to accomplish the tasks agreed upon in the Maastricht Ministerial Decision on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination;**

Tasks the ODIHR to:

- **Follow closely**, in full co-operation with other OSCE institutions as well as the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (UNCERD), the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI), the European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (EUMC) and other relevant international institutions and NGOs, **anti-Semitic incidents** in the OSCE area making use of all reliable information available;
- **Report its findings to the Permanent Council and to the Human Dimension Implementation Meeting and make these findings public.** These reports should also be taken into account in deciding on priorities for the work of the OSCE in the area of intolerance;
- **Systematically collect and disseminate information throughout the OSCE area on best practices** for preventing and responding to anti-Semitism and, if requested, offer advice to participating States in their efforts to fight anti-Semitism;

PC Decision 621 on Tolerance and the Fight against Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination

Tasks participating States to:

- Collect and maintain reliable information and statistics about hate crimes motivated by racism, xenophobia and related discrimination and intolerance, committed within their territory, **report such information periodically to the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR)** and make this information available to the public;
- **Endeavour to provide the ODIHR with the appropriate resources to accomplish the tasks agreed upon in the Maastricht Ministerial Decision on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination;**

Tasks the ODIHR to:

- **Follow closely**, in full co-operation with other OSCE institutions as well as the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (UNCERD), the United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (UNHCHR), the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI), the European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (EUMC) and other relevant international institutions and NGOs,

incidents motivated by racism, xenophobia, or related intolerance, including against Muslims, and anti-Semitism in the OSCE area making use of all reliable information available;

- **Report its findings to the Permanent Council and to the Human Dimension Implementation Meeting and make these findings public.** These reports should also be taken into account in deciding on priorities for the work of the OSCE in the area of intolerance;
- **Systematically collect and disseminate information throughout the OSCE area on best practices** for preventing and responding to racism, xenophobia and discrimination and, if requested, offer advice to participating States in their efforts to fight racism, xenophobia and discrimination;
- **Support the ability of civil society** and the development of partnerships to address racism, xenophobia, discrimination or related intolerance, including against Muslims, and anti-Semitism;

Ljubljana Ministerial Decision No. 11 on the Promotion of Human Rights Education and Training in the OSCE Area (Ljubljana MC 2005)

Tasks the ODIHR:

- To produce a **compendium of best practices** for participating States on enhancing the promotion of human rights education and training, including the promotion of tolerance, mutual respect and understanding, and non-discrimination in the OSCE area.

Ljubljana Ministerial Decision No. 10 on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination: Promoting Mutual Respect and Understanding (Ljubljana MC 2005)

Commits participating States to:

- Strengthen efforts to provide public officials, and in particular law enforcement officers, with appropriate training on responding to and preventing hate crimes, and in this regard, to consider setting up programmes that provide such training, and **to consider drawing on ODIHR expertise in this field and to share best practices;**
- Encourage public and private educational programmes that promote tolerance and non-discrimination, and raise public awareness of the existence and the unacceptability of intolerance and discrimination, and in this regard, **to consider drawing on ODIHR expertise and assistance in order to develop methods and curricula for tolerance education in general, including:**
 - Fighting racial prejudice and hatred, xenophobia and discrimination;
 - Education on and remembrance of the Holocaust, as well as other genocides, recognized as such in accordance with the 1948 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, and crimes against humanity;
 - Education on anti-Semitism in order to ensure a systematic approach to education, including curricula related to contemporary forms of anti-Semitism in participating States;
 - Fighting prejudice, intolerance and discrimination against Christians, Muslims and members of other religions;

- Strengthen efforts to collect and maintain reliable information and statistics on hate crimes and legislation within their territories, **to report such information periodically to the ODIHR**, and to make this information available to the public and **to consider drawing on ODIHR assistance in this field, and in this regard, to consider nominating national points of contact on hate crimes to the ODIHR;**

Tasks to the Secretary General:

- The Secretary General, **drawing on the expertise of the OSCE structures and institutions, in particular the ODIHR**, to provide in co-operation with participating States an OSCE contribution to the “Alliance of Civilizations” initiative and to bring it to the attention of the Alliance of Civilizations High-Level Group by the end of June 2006.

Tasks the ODIHR to:

- **Assist participating States upon their request in developing appropriate methodologies and capacities for collecting and maintaining reliable information and statistics about hate crimes** and violent manifestations of intolerance and discrimination, with a view to helping them to collect comparable data and statistics;
- **Continue its co-operation with other OSCE structures and institutions**, as well as with the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (UNCERD), the United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (UNHCHR), the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI), the European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (EUMC), the Task Force for International Co-operation on Holocaust Education, Remembrance and Research, and with other relevant institutions and civil society, **including non-governmental organizations;**
- Through its Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief, to **continue providing support to the participating States, upon their request, in their efforts to promote freedom of religion or belief**, and to share the Panel’s conclusions and opinions with OSCE participating States, both bilaterally and at relevant OSCE conferences and events;

Brussels Ministerial Decision No. 13 on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination and Promoting Mutual Respect and Understanding (Brussels MC 2006)

Encourages the ODIHR, based on existing commitments, including through co-operation with relevant OSCE executive structures to:

- Further **strengthen the work of its Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Programme, in particular its assistance programmes**, in order to assist participating States upon their request in implementing their commitments;
- Further strengthen the work of the ODIHR's Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief in **providing support and expert assistance** to participating States;
- Continue its close **co-operation with other relevant inter-governmental agencies and civil society** working in the field of promoting mutual respect and understanding and combating intolerance and discrimination, including through hate crime data collection;
- **Continue to serve as a collection point** for information and statistics on hate crimes and relevant legislation provided by participating States and to **make this information publicly available** through its Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Information System and its report on Challenges and Responses to Hate-Motivated Incidents in the OSCE Region;
- Strengthen, within existing resources, its **early warning function** to identify, report and raise awareness on hate-motivated incidents and trends and to **provide recommendations and assistance to participating States**, upon their request, in areas where more adequate responses are needed.

<p style="text-align: center;">Compilation of Recommendations from Key OSCE Events in 2005/2006</p>
--

Recommendations from the OSCE Conference on Anti-Semitism and on Other Forms of Intolerance (Cordoba, 8-9 June 2005)

Opening Session

European Union

- The European Union is firmly resolved to fight all forms of intolerance, racial discrimination, xenophobia and anti-Semitism;
Facing the painful question of the resurgence of anti-Semitism, participating States should underline their determination to mobilize governments and civil society to combat this abomination without hesitation;
Participating States should resolve to combat discrimination against Muslims, Christians and members of other religions and convictions as well as discrimination based on sex, sexual orientation, age and disability as enshrined in Article 13 of the Amsterdam Treaty.

United Kingdom

- To make commitments which came out of the OSCE Conferences at Berlin, Paris and Brussels a reality, it is important that participating States recognize the problem, then they can take steps to deal with it.

United States of America

- Participating States should follow a three-pronged approach — promoting awareness, appreciation and respect between their many cultural communities, enacting tough laws and policies to combat acts of discrimination and hate, and enforcing those laws and policies aggressively and constantly;
- Participating States should define, discover, quantify, study and eradicate anti-Semitism and all forms of ethnic and religious intolerance and violence whenever and wherever they are discovered.

Holy See

- Intolerance against Christians and members of other religions must be overcome with the same determination with which the struggle against anti-Semitism and discrimination against Muslims is carried out;
- The OSCE should commit itself to establish effective tools and mechanism to fight against prejudice and misrepresentations of Christians and members of other religions in the media and through education. The OSCE should also promote the effective contribution of Churches and religious communities to the public life.

Romania

- Participating States should recognize the substantial contributions of the NGOs to addressing the issue of intolerance.

Croatia

- Participating States should promote active co-operation with non-governmental organizations in the area of human rights and allocate funds for projects to NGOs directly from the State budget, in particular those whose programme promotes human rights and tolerance.

Bosnia and Herzegovina

- Participating States should reject the identification of terrorism and extremism with one religion, culture, ethnic group, nationality or race.

Russian Federation

- Participating States have a duty to continue to pay respect to the memory of all the soldiers who died liberating Europe from Fascism and saving not only the Jewish but also many other people from total destruction.

Turkey

- Respecting diversity does not mean creating “parallel societies” separated by walls of indifference, ignorance and hostility. Multiculturalism or “cultural diversity” should not be used as an excuse for ignoring fundamental human rights.

Czech Republic

- Participating States should look at the relationship between tolerance and identity. A reflection of one’s own identity is one of the ways to cure not only the consequences, but also the causes of anti-Semitism.

Kazakhstan

- New threats and challenges, in particular, rise in number of regional conflicts because of religious, racial and interethnic confrontations, growth of international terrorism and extremist activities, demand co-ordination of joint efforts in order to be able to address such complex problems.

Sweden

- Participating States should examine the mechanisms of exclusion and discrimination that may be built into the official structures and institutions of society.

B’nai B’rith International

- We should adopt, within the OSCE, the European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia’s working definition of anti-Semitism, and provide for the utilization of that EUMC standard in the monitoring efforts of the ODIHR;
- We must maintain our commitment to the specialized treatment of the roots and manifestations of anti-Semitism, even as we fittingly deplore and take firm steps to address intolerance in its many forms.

Jacob Blaustein Institute

- Extend the mandate of the newly appointed OSCE personal representatives and those in the ODIHR who are tasked to collect information on intolerance, especially those addressing anti-Semitism, which is a distinct phenomenon;

- Provide support for the personal representatives so they can work independently and direct their energies to where they are most needed, in accord with their mandates;
- Use a human rights response and methodology to address anti-Semitic acts, in accord with the OSCE's leading role in responding to human rights problems

World Jewish Congress

- The challenge to the OSCE is to continue to give teeth to the monitoring programmes designed to expose and stamp out expressions of anti-Semitism.

Session 1: Anti-Semitism and the media: inter alia, the press, TV, the Internet, radio, the film industry

United States of America

- OSCE participating States should encourage their national media to provide balanced reporting and should condemn anti-Semitic slants;
- Political and religious leaders in OSCE participating States should also follow the Vatican's lead by clearly and publicly condemning "anti-Zionism as a more recent manifestation of anti-Semitism".
- OSCE might provide training for journalists, filmmakers, and NGOs that promotes balanced reporting on Israel and Jewish issues;
- The ODIHR or the Office of the Representative for Freedom of the Media could hold expert meetings with Internet Service Providers, editors, news and film producers emphasizing the need for balanced portrayals of Israel.

Union of Jewish Students

- The participating States should work together in the fight against discrimination;
- The participating States should seek active co-operation with local and international NGOs. Co-operation will strengthen the fight against discrimination;
- The participating States and the OSCE Chairman-in-Office should strengthen the role of the personal representatives of the Chairman-in-Office and should give them the tools and resources to start working actively on the implementation of the "Berlin Declaration".

Council of Jewish Institutions of France

- The participating States should revise their practices regarding the problem of racist and anti-Semitic content of certain satellite televisions;
- The participating States should mutual reinforce their resources in observing medias which are broadcasting racist and anti-Semitic contents;
- The participating States should, through the framework of their national legislation, ensure that those responsible, inter alia cable or satellite providers, are given a direct responsibility for any illegal or compromising content that are being broadcasted.

Session 2: Education on the Holocaust and anti-Semitism

United States of America

- To encourage the establishment of a major museum/resource centre in every country to help educate and focus people on these vital issues;
- To establish an OSCE lending library of films and DVDs on intolerance in various languages for distribution to schools and religious centres;
- To create a poster series on the Holocaust for distribution to all OSCE participating States;
- To hold a future conference at a location that houses such a major facility in order to encourage discussion and help stimulate new material for use in educational programmes;
- To post an OSCE compliance record sheet that would track each country's implementation record.

Russian Federation

- There is a need for concerted efforts to draft a joint European strategy to combat manifestations of ethnic and religious intolerance and xenophobia and to step up the exchange of monitoring material regarding intolerance, both within Russia and in the European community;
- There should be no double standards, as is the case, for example of some recent members of the European Union, where there is discrimination against the Russian-speaking minority (not only ethnic Russians but also Russian-speaking Jews);
- The OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights and the High Commissioner on National Minorities, Mr. Rolf Ekéus, should intensify monitoring in the OSCE area, including the Baltic States, with particular account taken of the decisions adopted at the third Council of Europe summit in Warsaw.

Jacob Blaustein Institute for the Advancement of Human Rights (JBI)

- Link educational programmes, including both Holocaust education and general tolerance education, to focus on fighting contemporary anti-Semitism.

Session 3: Responding to anti-Semitic and hate-motivated crimes: the role of governments, institutions, legislation, law enforcement and civil society

Ukraine

- To expend the ODIHR's Hate Crime Training Programme for Law Enforcement Authorities, which would contribute to the development of the OSCE participating States' capacities in preventing, identifying, investigating and responding to anti-Semitic and hate-motivated crimes.

Jacob Blaustein Institute for the Advancement of Human Rights (JBI)

- OSCE pS to comply with their OSCE Commitments to combat anti-Semitism and discrimination at Copenhagen and since then, by adopting domestic legislation and enforcing it vigorously.
- Establish systems of monitoring incidents of anti-Semitism in each country.

ILGA Europe

To OSCE participating States

- To amend the draft Cordoba Declaration as circulated to include harassment and incitement to hate crime motivated by sexual orientation, gender identity and gender expression;
- To adopt and use the working definition of hate crimes developed by the ODIHR;
- To include sexual orientation and gender identity in the definition of hate crimes;
- To develop police training so that no crimes based on homophobic violence go unreported out of subsequent fear;
- To participate in the pilot training developed by the ODIHR for law enforcement on hate crimes;
- To develop awareness of, and support tolerance in all societies, in particular with regard to social and cultural events by minority groups.

To the OSCE

- States and institutions should support the further development of the recording and monitoring of hate crimes.

Session 4: Fighting intolerance and discrimination against Muslims: facilitating integration and respecting cultural diversity

General:

- There should be no hierarchy among the various forms of discrimination. A comprehensive approach to address anti-Semitism, discrimination against Muslims, Christians and other religions should be developed, but without losing sight of their respective unique characteristics and origins;
- The roles of the Personal Representatives of the Chairman-in-Office and of the ODIHR Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Unit should be expanded, with more resources being made available to them, and co-operation between them being promoted;
- The ODIHR's capacity to collect and disseminate data on hate crimes against Muslims should be improved;
- Participating States should recognize the need for integration and positive interaction, and special responsibility of leaders in these areas;
- Participating States should reject extremism, racism and xenophobia in all their forms and manifestations;
- A multilateral and concerted plan of action, engaging as many segments of society as possible, must be put into operation. To that end, those responsible should take a comprehensive approach to tackling the challenges faced;
- A mapping exercise on what has been achieved in the implementation of OSCE commitments regarding the fight against intolerance and discrimination against Muslims should be carried out;
- A national monitoring system should be put in place in order to collect data on acts of discrimination and hate-motivated crimes against Muslims;
- In countries where a substantial Muslim minority exists, structures should be established to facilitate relations between Muslims and the State, similar to those existing for Christians and Jews;

- In education, efforts to tackle anti-Semitism should also be related to “Islamophobia”;
- In countries where a substantial Muslim minority exists, Islam should be officially recognized.

Turkey

- Genuine Islamic thought and the contributions it has made to European civilization should be included in education programmes;
 - Distinction between criticizing and condemning a faith, including Islam, should be made clear and emphasized;
 - Standards and principles for responsible journalism should be developed to prevent dissemination of racist ideas and hate-speech against Muslims and other religious groups, without jeopardizing freedom of expression and of the media;
 - In taking security measures in the fight against terrorism, universal principles of human rights and fundamental freedoms should be taken into account.
- United States
- Mosques and other sites of religious significance should be visited by political leaders as a sign of solidarity.

ODIHR

- Co-operation should be established between the representatives of Muslim community and the law enforcement agencies not only to understand the specificities of crimes committed against them but also to enhance their capacity and willingness to report those crimes.

Session 5: Fighting intolerance and discrimination against Christians and members of other religions: respecting religious identity in a pluralistic society

General

- Concern was expressed about some interference in the self-organization of Christian and other religious confessions that prevents them from acting in accordance with their own moral convictions. It was consequently recommended that participating States should refrain from these interferences
- It was also recommended that training and educational programmes that lack due respect for the identity and principles of Christianity and of other religions should be reformed;
- In some areas tensions were registered regarding the recognition of the public role of religions. In this regard, it was stressed that the distinction between religious communities and State institutions did not entail estrangement, indifference, and lack of communication, but dialogue and sharing in the promotion of human dignity as a cornerstone of all human rights. Some delegations therefore recommended that the OSCE should make, and encourage participating States to make concerted efforts to promote the participation of religious confessions in public life;
- Several delegations noted the occurrence in the media of stereotyping, episodes of intolerance and even of denigration and hate speech against Christians and members of other religions. Many delegations recommended that the OSCE should raise the awareness of participating States, and develop

measures in order to fight prejudice, intolerance and discrimination against Christians and members of other religion in the media and education. It was also recommended that the OSCE could consider establishing specific mechanisms or tools to assist participating States in taking appropriate action to protect Christians and members of other religions as it does in other fields.

- One delegation stressed that there was no longer a need to focus on high-level political conferences, but rather on meetings at expert level aimed at sharing best practices and assessing the implementation of commitments. Another delegation expressed concerns about restrictions, in some participating States, on the use of religious symbols and attire.

Holy See

To the OSCE

- The OSCE should promote the presence and the effective contribution of Churches and religious communities to the public life of participating States, guaranteeing their specific identity and recognizing their fundamental contribution to society.

To the OSCE participating States

- The participating States should recognize the right of Christians and members of other religions to participate in every dimension of public life without discrimination.

United States of America

- The participating States should encourage the media to offer balanced coverage of religious faith;
- The participating States should take action to ensure that educational systems teach the value of faith in people's lives.

Italy

- The OSCE should elaborate common criteria and effective actions to eradicate ethnic and religious prejudices as well as intolerance in the media and education.

Kazakhstan

- The OSCE was invited to give a follow up in Kazakhstan to the Cordoba Conference, so as to share with participating States the best practices concerning inter-religious dialogue.

The ODIHR Panel of experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief

- OSCE/ODIHR should encourage the organization of meetings of NGOs and civil society in problematic areas and in order to focus on the implementation of religious freedom;
- The OSCE should establish tools and mechanisms in order to fight discrimination in the media.

Session 6: Fighting racism, xenophobia and other forms of intolerance and discrimination: inter alia, the roles of education and the media

- Education: It was recommended that training and educational programmes should be reformed, and it was stressed that school curricula should cover cultural diversity, and that special programmes should be launched to promote the integration of newcomers.
- In the classroom the child should be protected against all kinds of propaganda;
- Media: The issue of hate speech and the continuing dissemination of prejudices, in such media as TV programmes, the Internet and the press should be addressed by raising awareness among journalists and media professionals, by encouraging the adoption of codes of conduct, by fostering co-operation between all stakeholders — the media, relevant government agencies, civil society and representatives of minority communities — with a view to promoting best practices, and by ensuring reporting on expression of bias in the press. Participating States and other participants were invited to make full use of programmes implemented by the OSCE/RFOM, such as the Freedom on the Internet Cookbook. There was a need for a media handbook of best practices;
- Law enforcement: There was a need for more systematic co-operation among relevant bodies in participating States, training programmes should be made available OSCE-wide, and partnerships with NGOs and representatives of minorities should be developed;
- Civil society: NGOs should be granted support for the establishment of appropriate reporting mechanisms in order to monitor incidents and to promote mutual understanding.

Azerbaijan

- The OSCE should enhance its efforts to combat nationalist ideologies and promote relations of good neighbourhood and tolerance among participating States.

Russian Federation

- The OSCE should promote initiatives aimed at promoting a comprehensive and multi-faceted approach in the fight against racism, xenophobia and discrimination.
- Special emphasis should be put on the fight against discriminations against persons belonging to national minorities.

Turkey

- In combating racism, xenophobia and discrimination, we should go beyond intercultural education, citizenship education or the teaching of international human rights instruments. The OSCE/ODIHR should develop a concept of “ethical education of human rights” based on the spirit which has produced the “Universal Declaration of Human Rights”.
- The OSCE/RFOM should assist participating States in identifying problems related to racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda or biases in the media and support efforts aimed at developing codes of conduct for journalists and media professionals in this field.

UNHCR

- The OSCE/ODIHR should develop a concept of ethical education on human rights as a key to social integration.

Centre AVER of Research and Action against all Forms of Racism

- Participating States should take action to counter bias against Roma and Sinti, in particular through education and awareness raising of journalists and media professionals;
- Calls for representation on government advisory, administrative and other councils in order to understand better and to meet more adequately the needs of the Roms in France;
- Calls for the creation of awareness programmes within the educational system as well as those geared to mainstream society as a whole;
- Asks for the creation of documentation centres and databases on the positive values of the Romani people in Europe, but which also speaks out against discrimination of Romani individuals and groups;
- Calls on supporting the promotion of Romani cultural events in order to reduce intolerance, hostility and overt racism towards the Romani community;
- Stresses the need for a special support to be addressed to young Roms wishing to graduate from middle and high school in order to get involved in all levels of public life, as a means of assuring for more participation and representation of the Roms on governmental, administrative, academic and institutional levels;
- Calls for a better integration of the Roms.

ILGA Europe

To OSCE participating States

- To abolish discriminatory legislation in relation to lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender rights, in particular in relation to discriminatory age of consent in some of the member States;
- To develop educational tools for promotion of tolerance in schools and other educational institutions, inclusive for all minority issues, including sexual orientation, gender identity and gender expression;
- To ensure the ODIHR has sufficient resources to work on tolerance and anti-discrimination initiatives;
- To provide resources for NGOs to ensure proper partnerships between the ODIHR and civil society, as well as possibility to implement joint projects, for example in the field of data collection on hate crimes;
- To ensure continuity, strengthen and fully resource the offices of the three Personal Representatives of the Chairman-in-Office.

European Roma Information Office

To the OSCE

- A monitoring body focusing on antigypsyism is missing despite many reports proving the need for such a body. OSCE should include antigypsyism in its monitoring initiatives;
- Encourage States to adopt a media law or lobby the European Commission for a media directive able to regulate the promotion of equality of opportunities and equal access to broadcasting facilities for minorities (including Roma);

- The OSCE-Council of Europe Conference on Antigypsyism should target specifically big media outlets for its media segment;
- Recommendations for the governments to adopt general laws able to prevent antigypsyism are needed. The OSCE should recommend to its European participating States to adopt the European Commission's proposal for a framework directive on racism and xenophobia from December 2001, which offers a powerful device against racist media slandering and transpose it into national law;
- OSCE should actively promote inclusion of Roma in its structures, as the number of Roma experts is very small. Efforts in this direction, as recommended by the OSCE Action Plan to the national governments should be taken within the organization in order to employ Roma in relevant departments especially in those dealing with monitoring and anti-discrimination;
- Incentives for journalist targeting pro-tolerance initiatives in mass media are needed and OSCE should take an active role in establishing such incentives (prizes or media productions financed by OSCE combating antigypsyism);
- Common trainings for non-Roma journalists and Roma with an explicit target not just in training but delivery of media products should be encouraged under the OSCE.

To OSCE participating States

- Specific recognition of existing antigypsyism and its major contra-effect in achieving social inclusion and stability is needed at the national level. Conferences and public debates hosted by media but also national parliaments about the effects of antigypsyism should be encouraged;
- Participating States should urgently establish national bodies at the governmental level to design, steer, assess and monitor the initiatives, action plans or policies targeting Roma. These bodies should be responsible for monitoring the antigypsyism and design measures to combat it. Facilitating a good working relation with the Roma NGOs should be a priority for those bodies;
- Adoption of the international legislation dealing with protection of minorities and slandering in mass media should be a must. The existing national media councils should include in their management Roma and people from other discriminated minorities;
- Active promoting inclusion of Roma in the relevant national ministries has to be a priority and positive measures have to be taken in order to achieve an acceptable quota of Roma paid from the budget.

Recommendations from the 2006 Human Dimension Implementation Committee (Warsaw, 2-3 October 2006)

The following recommendations resulted from Working Sessions 16 and 17: (specifically selected topic) Promotion of tolerance, non-discrimination and mutual respect and understanding: the implementation of OSCE commitments

To the OSCE participating States

- The concrete implementation of OSCE and other human rights commitments.
- Member States of the Council of Europe are encouraged to sign and ratify Protocol No. 12 to the European Convention on Human Rights.
- To enact legislation against racism and racial discrimination, if such legislation does not already exist or is incomplete and to ensure that the key components set out in ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 7 are provided in such legislation.
- To secure sufficient resources for relevant ODIHR programs.
- To support the Alliance of Civilizations project.
- To focus on media and public discourse.
- To establish an anti-discrimination agency in each pS.
- To strengthen the early-warning mechanism of the OSCE.
- To support the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disability.

To the OSCE, its institutions and field operations

- OSCE institutions are encouraged to continue their co-operation in the fight against racism, racial discrimination and all forms of intolerance with the CoE by further strengthening mechanisms enabling the free flow of and exchange of information data.
- In the fight against discrimination and intolerance, ODIHR should avoid extending its action to fight against intolerance to issues where there is no consensus.
- To allocate more resources to the TND program.
- To focus on socio-economic inequities facing Muslims to ensure full participation and engagement in all aspects of society.
- To establish contacts with the Organization of the Islamic Conference (OIC)

Recommendations on hate crime

To the OSCE participating States

- To collect comprehensive and accurate data, which shall include specific information regarding the age of perpetrators and victims of hate crime. Participate in the elaboration of a uniform hate crime monitoring programme.
- To adopt a law in participating States, according to which hate crimes can no longer be classified as 'hooliganism'.

To the OSCE, its institutions and field operations

- To make participating States delivering annual reports on hate crime and measures for counteracting it.
- Develop a single minimum standard for hate crime monitoring and, accordingly, universal and comparable requirements for OSCE pS' annual reporting on hate crime counteraction. In developing these standards and in

promoting such monitoring, the Special Representatives on discrimination and xenophobia, anti-Semitism and Islamophobia must play an active role.

- Introduce a training programme for press officers to prevent their use of language derogatory towards ethnic and religious groups.

Recommendations on religious freedom

To the OSCE participating States

- To intensify dialogue with Muslim Communities in their respective States.
- Specific religious freedom and other human rights violations must be publicly named.
- Make it clear through concrete actions that policy towards OSCE pS which violate religious freedom will be strongly influenced by the practical actions those states take in relation to all religious communities, not just state-favoured ones, and that paper improvements alone will not be viewed as improvements.

To the OSCE, its institutions and field operations

- To devote more attention to dialogue, especially with respect to Islamophobia.
- To pay more attention to intolerance and discrimination affecting Christians.
- To devote more attention to the rights of non-believers and take note that freedom of religion is only one dimension of the freedom of conscience.
- To organize a structured dialogue with the highest leaders of religious denominations about the most fundamental individual and collective rights related to freedom of religion and belief.
- To elaborate a Declaration of Inter-religious Tolerance and Respect and to put in place mechanisms of evaluation of the progress of the implementation

Recommendations on the three Personal Representatives

To the OSCE participating States

- That mandates should be extended.
- That the OSCE Personal Representative of the CiO for Combating Anti-Semitism be continued.
- That the mandate of the Special Representative of the Chairman-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and discrimination, also focusing on Intolerance against Christians and members of other religions should be modified, and that the mandate for Intolerance against Christians and members of other religions be established as a separate one.
- That sufficient funding is designated for the PRs

To the OSCE, its institutions and field operations

- Recommendation to the Spanish Chairmanship to renew the mandates of the three Personal Representatives. Personal Representative should pay more attention to youth participation.

Recommendations on homophobia

To the OSCE participating States

- To decriminalize same sex acts.

- To agree on explicit commitment on sexual orientation.
- To safeguard and protect all basic rights, and thus preventing discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation.
- That LGBT people have their rights respected and protected by law as it already applies to those who identify themselves as members of a religious or faith community.

To the OSCE, its institutions and field operations

- That homophobia is addressed at the Dubrovnik meeting, the Bucharest Conference and any other relevant TND and Human Rights events.

Recommendations on cyber hate

To the OSCE participating States

- To sign and ratify the Additional Protocol to the Council of Europe's Convention on Cybercrime, on the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature through computer systems.
- To fulfil the commitments of the Sofia Ministerial Decision 12/04 by giving material support to National NGOs that monitor and fight online hate content (Cyber hate).

Recommendations on tolerance education

To the OSCE participating States

- The importance of education in creating better awareness of the issues concerned.
- To follow-up on issues in relation to Islamophobia and Education.
- To mainstream tolerance and non-discrimination into curricula.
- Importance of holocaust education.

To the OSCE, its institutions and field operations

- The TND Programme of ODIHR should pay more effective attention to the implementation of the specific OSCE commitment to fight against prejudice, intolerance and discriminations against Christians and members of other religions; this applies too in the context of education as a means to promote respect and understanding and in the work of ODIHR related to *Challenges and Responses to Hate-Motivated Incidents*.

Recommendations on youth and tolerance issues

To the OSCE, its institutions and field operations

- To develop a Working Group on the role of youth and youth organisations in tackling hate-related acts of intolerance and discrimination.

The following recommendations resulted from Working Session 13: Fundamental freedoms II (including: freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief)

- The interagency cooperation between the HCNM and the Advisory Panel on Freedom of Religion or Belief should be continued.
- The Advisory Panel should be empowered to provide guidance and advice to participating States on all pending legislation related to freedom of religion.
- The OSCE/ODIHR should open a debate with all participating States on the forms of religious discrimination that still exist.
- The OSCE/ODIHR should give some concrete content to the “base level entity status” proposed in the brochure on “Freedom of Religion or Belief: Laws Affecting the Structuring of Religious Communities” by listing a number of basic rights that religious and belief communities have not been able to enjoy by now.
- The OSCE/ODIHR should put in place mechanisms of evaluation of the progress of the implementation of the basic religious rights that any OSCE participating State should grant.
- The OSCE/ODIHR should monitor different types of infringement of state neutrality. The ODIHR could coordinate such a monitoring, but the three Personal Representatives should also be involved. New recommendations with respect to state neutrality could be drafted for participating States.
- The ODIHR should explore how state neutrality can be maintained without forcing certain religious groups underground.
- The ODIHR should advise participating States with respect to the terminology and concepts used in their legislation and policies. It is recommended to replace the term “sect” with the term “religious minority” and to critically review that even agnostic Sikhs are often labelled “religious”.
- Both religious and non-religious beliefs have to be protected. It is recommended that an ODIHR expert inquires and reports on the degree to which religious groups are privileged over non-believers in the OSCE area.
- The OSCE/ODIHR as well as participating States should pay more attention to the inclusion of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Trans-Gender believers into their respective religious communities.
- The OSCE and other international bodies should protect the Ecumenical Patriarchate of Istanbul.
- The OSCE should devote more attention to the rights of believers in Belarus and enter into a dialogue with Belarusian authorities on the matter.
- The OSCE should continue to pay attention to tensions arising from registration laws and counter-terrorism policies in Russia and Central Asia. The ODIHR could follow up on these issues.
- The OSCE is called upon to take appropriate steps to correct current breaches of religious freedom in Uzbekistan.
- The OSCE should appoint observers for Mufti elections taking place in Greece.
- The OSCE should question the city plans drafted in Greece which envisage the damaging of Mosques.
- OSCE participating States should agree that judges should not inform their decision by religious beliefs or prejudices.

- OSCE participating States should pay attention to the situation of the Hare Krishna community in Kazakhstan and give advice on how to solve this problem.
- Participating States should consult with the Advisory Panel, i.a. on issues of legislation, and channel their requests through the ODIHR Adviser on Freedom of Religion or Belief.
- Participating States should remove restrictions on the wearing of religious symbols in public buildings.
- Participating States should continue to fight anti-Semitism, Islamophobia as well as other forms of religious intolerance.
- Participating States should investigate and prosecute hate crimes.
- Participating States should ensure a separation of church and state.
- Participating States should abolish criminal defamation laws.
- Participating States should ensure that detainees are allowed to practice their religion or belief.
- Participating States should reinstate mandatory religious education in schools.
- Participating States should explicitly mention sexual orientation as a possible ground for discrimination in their commitments on fundamental freedoms, such as that of religion and belief.

Recommendations from Human Dimension Seminar on Migration and Integration (Warsaw, May 2005)

Working Group III: Participation of legal migrants in public life and society

Recommendations to the OSCE participating States:

- To establish legal frameworks aimed at preventing structural and institutional discrimination against migrants, which seriously jeopardize participation;
- To establish interstate dialogue between sending and receiving States as well as social dialogue between trade unions, employers and government when dealing with problems of migrant workers;
- To provide the opportunity for economic empowerment through capacity-building programmes designed for migrants;
- To consider providing migrants with the right to elect and be elected particularly in local elections;
- To liberalize citizenship laws and consider granting dual citizenship as an efficient means of facilitating integration while preserving the identity of migrants;
- To pay special attention, and undertake special efforts, to ensure the inclusion of migrant women in integration programmes. This should encompass the involvement of women in the development of policies and programmes;
- To take into account the special role women can play in the prevention of and fight against religious or belief-based discrimination, intolerance or violence and undertake to ensure the involvement of women representing religions or beliefs in countries of origin as well as the country of destination in the promotion of intra- and interfaith dialogue;
- To provide easily accessible and understandable information to migrants in their own languages on all aspects of their civic rights and obligations, including the labour market, housing, health and community services as well as civic and political participation. Awareness-raising should be among the central activities in the process of integration;
- To encourage and support media in the language of migrants;
- To provide the necessary legal framework for migrants participation in trade unions;
- To simplify procedures for releasing work permits or documents to the migrants;
- To co-operate closely with migrant interest groups for the purposes of awareness-raising on specific issues, capacity-building and consultation in decision-making on issues related to migrants.

Recommendations to the OSCE institutions and field operations:

- The ODIHR should continue its activities in the area of religion and freedom of belief as one of the core priorities of the Organization and should continue to include specific aspects related to migration, as well as ensuring a gender perspective;
- The OSCE, in cooperation with other relevant international organizations, should facilitate dialogue and cooperation between countries of origin and host countries in the search for co-operative solutions to migration-related problems;
- The OSCE should initiate a process for developing a document on principles of integration which promote inclusion.

Working Group IV: Socio-cultural aspects of integration

Recommendations to the OSCE participating States:

- To take measures to provide information to migrants in their own languages on all aspects of their civic rights and obligations. Migrant interest groups should play a crucial role in awareness-raising on specific issues, capacity-building and consultation in decision-making on issues related to migrants;
- To promote intra-and interfaith dialogue and make every effort to prevent and combat religious or belief-based discrimination in relation to migration;
- To take further measures to improve the language skills of migrants and to provide quality vocational training designed to meet the needs of migrants.

Recommendations to the OSCE institutions and field operations:

- The ODIHR should maintain an ongoing exchange of views with the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities in addressing issues related to new minorities and further develop the ODIHR Programme on Tolerance and non-Discrimination by including issues related to new minorities;
- The ODIHR should continue its activities in the area of religion and freedom of belief as one of the core priorities of the Organization and should continue to include specific aspects related to migration, as well as ensuring a gender perspective.

ANNEX I: ODIHR's Toolbox to Combat Hate

In order to support participating States in implementing their OSCE commitments related to tolerance and non-discrimination, the ODIHR has, over the last two years, developed tools and networks of experts to provide technical assistance to OSCE states in their efforts to combat manifestations of hate and intolerance. The following table provides a summary of the ODIHR's toolboxes available for OSCE participating States and civil society. The ODIHR hope that an increasing number of OSCE states will utilise these available tools. More information on these tools can be found on the ODIHR's website at: <http://www.osce.org/odihr/13477.html>

I. Toolbox for OSCE participating States

Tool	Description	States using Tool
Law enforcement training	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Uses a train-the-trainer approach that is tailored to each target country - Trains police officers methods for identifying and investigating hate crimes, as well as skills for sharing intelligence and working with prosecutors and affected communities - Designed and delivered <i>by</i> police officers <i>for</i> police officers - Network of law enforcement hate crime experts from six OSCE states - Comprehensive training curriculum, (including working definitions and a police reporting form template) which states customise to their needs 	<p>Implementation completed¹:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Spain - Hungary <p>Implementation ongoing:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Croatia - Ukraine - Serbia - Poland <p>Initial interest shown by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Romania - Russian Federation
Training on Policing within Roma communities	Offers a good practice model for systematic assessment and review of current policing policy and practices	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Russian Federation - Poland - Romania - UK
Guidelines and assessment of hate crime data collection methodologies	<p>Comprehensive report developed - <i>Combating Hate Crimes in the OSCE Region: An Overview of Statistics, Legislation, and National Initiatives</i> which identifies gaps and deficiencies in the collection of data and developed tools, and offers a working definition of hate crime and a police reporting form to support states in their efforts to strengthen data collection and legislation related to hate crime.</p> <p>In November 2006, a first meeting of national focal points on hate crime from each of the 56 OSCE states was organized by the ODIHR. The meeting provided experts from throughout the region with an opportunity to discuss common strategies and to develop methods for improving the collection of statistics on hate crime.</p> <p>The ODIHR has now identified a group of data experts available to provide support and assistance to participating States in their efforts to strengthen their data collection methodologies. In mid-June, data experts will travel to Croatia in order to identify areas for possible co-operation and assistance.</p>	48 states have nominated National Points of Contact on Hate Crime

¹ Since being piloted, the hate-crime curriculum has been added to the regular training programme for officers studying at the police academies in both Hungary and Spain.

<p>Guidelines and assessment of educational approaches on Education on the Holocaust and Anti-Semitism</p>	<p>Comprehensive study developed – <i>Education on the Holocaust and on Anti-Semitism. An Overview and Analysis of Educational Approaches</i> – which evaluates existing approaches and identifies good practices to support future efforts by OSCE states and civil society. It also identifies gaps and areas where teaching about the Holocaust and anti-Semitism needs to be strengthened.</p> <p>With its comprehensive recommendations it provides a framework for the development of curricula on Holocaust Education and combating anti-Semitism.</p>	
<p>Guidelines for Educators on Holocaust Commemoration</p>	<p>Offer suggestions to educators how to prepare for Holocaust memorial days by identifying and presenting best practices from 12 OSCE participating States. Available in 13 languages.</p> <p>Developed in cooperation between the ODIHR, Yad Vashem and educational experts from 12 countries: Austria, Sweden, the Netherlands, Croatia, Poland, Hungary, Lithuania, United Kingdom, Russian Federation, Ukraine, Germany and Israel</p> <p>Available on the ODIHR's website in: English, Russian, Italian, French, Dutch, Croatian, Hungarian. A German and a Polish version will be available soon.</p>	<p>Contributed to guidelines: Germany Belgium Poland Switzerland</p> <p>Using tool officially: Italy Croatia Hungary</p>
<p>Educational Materials to Teach about anti-Semitism</p>	<p>Teaching material in seven versions and languages have been developed in seven OSCE states. The material was developed by experts from each of the seven countries, together with the ODIHR and experts from the Anne Frank House in Amsterdam.</p> <p>Country-specific adaptations, based on the historical and current situation in each country have been developed and piloted. The materials come in three parts: Part 1 is on the history of anti-Semitism, part 2 on contemporary forms of anti-Semitism and part 3 puts anti-Semitism into perspective with other forms of discrimination. There is also a teacher's guide which comes with the materials.</p> <p>Teaching Material is now being developed for three additional participating States</p>	<p>Germany Netherlands Ukraine Lithuania Croatia Denmark Poland</p> <p>Russian Federation Spain Turkey</p>
<p>Recommendations to education authorities on how to strengthen diversity education</p>	<p>Comprehensive assessment report (currently under development) with recommendations concerning curricula development on diversity education, production of school material, definition and implementation of quality standards, national diversity education strategies as well as pre-and in-service teacher training in the public school sector.</p> <p>Establishment of network of experts available to provide assistance</p>	<p>Azerbaijan (request for assistance)</p>
<p>TANDIS Tolerance and Non-discrimination Information System</p>	<p>A public website was launched in October 2006 which offers one-point access to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Information received from the OSCE states, NGOs and other organizations; - Country pages providing access to country initiatives, legislation, national specialized bodies, statistics, and other information; - Thematic pages with information related to different key issues; - International standards and instruments; - Information from intergovernmental organizations including country reports and annual reports. 	
<p>Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provides legislative assistance to participating States preparing or amending legislation pertaining to freedom of religion or belief; - Offers expert opinions on specific infringements of freedom of religion or belief to participating States; - Supports educational and training projects in order to raise awareness about FORB standards - Provides support in mediation/conflict prevention. 	<p>In 2006, legislative assistance was provided to 5 participating States and opinions/interventions on cases involving potential violations of religious freedom were offered in 3 cases.</p>

II. Toolbox for Civil Society:

Tool	Description	Users of the Tool
Facilitator's curriculum on hate-motivated violence and network of trainers and experts	Development of : Facilitators' curriculum for civil society on hate-motivated violence Network of trainers and experts throughout the OSCE region	Civil society within the region
Consultation Mechanisms	Support of States wishing to develop sustainable consultation mechanisms on a local, regional or national level addressing hate-motivated violence (local and regional authorities, civil society and community representatives, media)	To be determined
Complaints bureau on hate-motivated violence and hate speech on the internet	The ODIHR supports NGOs to initiate monitoring activity and to establish complaints bureau on hate-motivated violence and hate speech on the internet.	Civil society representatives from: Slovakia, the Russian Federation, Poland
NGO meetings and roundtables	The ODIHR hosts and facilitates thematic roundtables and preparatory meetings for NGOs to give civil society representatives the opportunity to draft recommendations	Civil society within the OSCE region
Access to NGO human rights information	The ODIHR has a strategic partnership with the HURIDOCS ² in order to provide best access to findings and reports from human rights NGOs via the existing vertical search engine HuriSearch which is indexing more than 2.500 human rights NGO websites. HuriSearch will be an integrated part of the ODIHR website by the end of 2006.	Civil society within the OSCE region.
Support of networks and creation of coalitions	Support the development of existing civil society networks and the creation of new coalitions on issues related to ODIHR's mandate	Civil Society networks within the OSCE region (i.e. UNITED for intercultural action and against racism, International Network Against Cyber Hate)

² Human Rights Information and Documentation Systems International, Geneva

ANNEX 2

Information Submitted to the ODIHR in the Period of 2004-2006: Legislation, Statistics, Practical Initiatives and Nominated Points of Contact on Combating Hate Crime

TOTAL NUMBER OF PARTICIPATING STATES THAT:

Responded:	51	91%
Nominated National Point of Contact:	48	86%
Submitted information about Legislation (LEG):	46	82%
Submitted information about Statistics (STAT):	39	70%
Submitted information about Practical Initiatives (INIT):	38	68%

STATE	DATE OF RESPONSE	LEG	STAT	INIT	NATIONAL POINT OF CONTACT
Albania	13 April 2004 8 February 2006 2 March 2006 12 September 2006	√	√		Ministry of Interior, General Department of State Police, section on protection of Children, Division of Terrorist Acts and Crimes
Andorra	19 September 2005 24 July 2006	√	√	√	Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Culture and Cooperation
Armenia					
Austria	28 April 2004 3 October 2006	√	√	√	Federal Ministry of the Interior, Department II/BVT/2 (statistics) Federal Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Department I/7 (legislation, national initiatives, reports)
Austria	28 April 2004 3 October 2006	√	√	√	Federal Ministry of the Interior, Department II/BVT/2 (statistics) Federal Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Department I/7 (legislation, national initiatives, reports)
Azerbaijan	17 October 2005 7 March 2006 20 April 2007	√	√		Office of the Prosecutor General of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Department on control of compliance with the legislation during investigations, inquiries and operational search activities by the Ministry of Internal Affairs
Belarus	25 April 2004	√	√	√	
Belgium	10 November 2004	√	√	√	Centre for Equal Opportunities and Opposition to Racism (CEOOR)
Bosnia and Herzegovina	2 December 2005				Ministry of Security, Department of Organised Crime and Corruption
Bulgaria	14 April 2004 30 June 2004 9 September 2005 12 September 2005 24 August 2006	√	√	√	Office of the Ombudsman of the Republic of Bulgaria Commission for the Protection against Discrimination
Canada	29 June 2004 9 September 2005	√	√	√	Department of Canadian Heritage Multiculturalism and Human Rights Branch

STATE	DATE OF RESPONSE	LEG	STAT	INIT	NATIONAL POINT OF CONTACT
Croatia	9 March 2004 27 April 2004 4 July 2005 25 May 2007	√	√	√	Ministry of Foreign Affairs and European Integration Department for Human Rights
Cyprus	21 July 2004 1 September 2004 16 January 2006 23 February 2006 21 May 2007	√	√	√	Ministry of Justice and Public Order (legislation) Cyprus Police, Office for Combating Discrimination (statistical data and educational programmes for the police)
Czech Republic	15 September 2004 1 September 2005 8 September 2006	√	√	√	Ministry of the Interior Interministerial Commission for Combating Extremism, Racism and Xenophobia
Denmark	5 April 2004 31 August 2005 12 September 2006	√	√	√	Ministry of Justice, Law Department, Criminal Law Division
Estonia	7 October 2004 8 November 2005 23 May 2007	√	√		Ministry of Justice, Criminal Policies Department
Finland	11 March 2004 29 November 2005	√	√	√	Ministry of the Interior PL 26 (statistics) Ministry of Labour PL 34 (other)
France	12 July 2004 10 August 2005 3 August 2006	√	√	√	Ministry of Justice, Department of European and International Affairs
Georgia	18 May 2007				Ministry of Justice, International Law Department
Germany	18 March 2004 29 June 2004 10 September 2004	√	√	√	Ministry of the Interior
Greece	11 October 2004 5 November 2004 8 March 2006	√		√	Ministry of Justice
Holy See	22 March 2004 9 November 2004 2 December 2005 4 September 2006 7 September 2006 15 May 2007 17 May 2007	√	N/A	√	Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace
Hungary	15 July 2004 12 October 2005	√	√		Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Department of Human Rights and European Organisations
Iceland	16 July 2006				National Commissioner of Police
Ireland	4 November 2004 17 October 2005	√	√	√	National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism (NCCRI)
Italy	24 April 2004 18 November 2004 26 April 2005 17 August 2005 10 October 2005 4 April 2006 7 August 2006	√	√	√	Ministry of the Interior, Department of Public Safety
Kazakhstan	27 July 2004 2 December 2005	√	√		General Prosecutor's Office, Committee on Law, Statistics and Special Registrations
Kyrgyzstan					
Latvia	15 April 2004 July-August 2006	√	√	√	Secretariat of the Special Assignments Minister for Social Integration Latvian National Human Rights Office

STATE	DATE OF RESPONSE	LEG	STAT	INIT	NATIONAL POINT OF CONTACT
Liechtenstein	4 May 2004 12 November 2004 17 November 2005 10 September 2006 4 May 2007	√	√	√	Office for Foreign Affairs, Working Group against Racism, Anti-Semitism and Xenophobia Liechtenstein National Police, Crime Investigation Division
Lithuania	1 April 2004 2 November 2004 16 September 2005 18 May 2007	√	√	√	Ministry of the Interior, Analysis and Research Division of the Public Safety Department
Luxembourg	1 April 2004 28 July 2004 18 October 2004 11 November 2004	√	√	√	Government's Commissioner for Foreigners International Networks for Studies in Technology, Environment, Alternatives, Development
Malta	5 April 2004 19 July 2004 31 December 2004 2 February 2005 9 September 2005	√	√	√	General Police Headquarters Prosecutions Unit
Moldova	14 April 2004 28 April 2007	√	√		General Prosecutor's Department of the Republic of Moldova
Monaco	24 November 2004	√		√	Department of the Interior Department of Legal Services
Montenegro	2 September 2004 11 November 2004 4 November 2005	√	√	√	
Netherlands	4 August 2004 5 August 2004 1 February 2006 31 May 2007	√	√	√	Ministry of Justice, Directorate-General for Law Enforcement
Norway	1 September 2004 15 September 2005	√	√	√	Ministry of Justice and the Police (main contact point) Ministry of Local Government and Regional Development, Department of Integration and Diversity
Poland	1 March 2004 25 August 2005 11 September 2006	√	√	√	Ministry of Interior and Administration, Department of Denominations and National Minorities
Portugal	30 September 2005 11 October 2005 4 May 2006 18 September 2006	√			Prosecutor General, Documentation and Comparative Law Office High Commission for Immigration and Ethnic Minorities (ACIME)
Romania	10 March 2004 22 February 2006 5 September 2006 3 May 2007	√	√	√	Ministry of Justice, Directorate of International Law and Treaties
Russian Federation	24 December 2004 27 December 2005	√	√	√	Ministry of Foreign Affairs Department for Humanitarian Co-operation and Human Rights
San Marino					
Serbia	2 September 2004 11 November 2004 8 November 2005 8 September 2006 11 May 2007	√	√	√	Agency of Human and Minority Rights

STATE	DATE OF RESPONSE	LEG	STAT	INIT	NATIONAL POINT OF CONTACT
Slovak Republic	9 July 2004 28 October 2005 16 May 2007	√	√	√	Ministry of Interior, Committee for Coordination of Anti-Extremism Policy, Office of the Minister of Interior
Slovenia	9 August 2004 9 September 2005 7 February 2006	√		√	Ministry of Foreign Affairs International Organizations and Human Security Division
Spain	November 2004	√	√	√	Permanent Mission of Spain to the OSCE
Sweden	11 June 2004 16 September 2005 1 June 2007	√	√	√	Swedish National Council for Crime Prevention
Switzerland	17 March 2004 13 September 2006	√	√	√	Federal Department of the Interior Service for Combating Racism Federal Commission against Racism Swiss Department of Foreign Affairs, OSCE Section
Tajikistan	14 December 2005				Executive Office of the President, Constitutional Rights Department
The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	24 February 2006				Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Human Rights Department
Turkey	10 September 2004	√		√	Ministry of Justice, Directorate General of International Law and External Relations
Turkmenistan					
Ukraine	11 August 2004 3 August 2006				Ministry of Interior, National Academy of Internal Affairs
United Kingdom	9 September 2004	√	√	√	
United States	19 April 2004 14 January 2005 12 September 2005	√	√	√	U.S. Mission to the OSCE, Human Dimension Officer
Uzbekistan					